KO   KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

Contents

Contents pages

Abstract: Most knowledge organization practices have opinionated detractors. Some criticisms are informed and serious, but unsubstantiated assertions and fatuous dismissals are so commonplace that practitioners grow weary of the perpetual need to refute them. Many have had the experience of conducting and publishing research that contradicts a popular misguided claim, and then seeing this evidence have little effect on the continued repetition of the claim. In this paper, which is part polemical essay, I attempt to contribute another tool for tackling this problem: a taxonomy of attacks on knowledge organization. Categorizing and devising names for the major strains of deprecation of knowledge organization, cataloging, and metadata will not defeat those arguments, but identifying and reframing them might strengthen the knowledge organization community's resolve to take them on. Warning: there might be neologisms!

Abstract: A naïve user seeking introductory information on a topic may perceive a domain as it is shown by the search results in a database; however, inconsistencies in indexing can misrepresent the full picture of the domain by including irrelevant documents or omitting relevant ones, sometimes inexplicably. A bibliometric analysis was conducted on the domain of ethics in knowledge organization in the World of Science (WoS) and Library, Information Science & Technology Abstracts (LISTA) databases to discern how it is being presented by search results in those databases and to attempt to determine why inconsistencies occurred.

Abstract: We collected the tags associated with the American Library Association's Top 100 Banned/Challenged Books: 2000-2009 on LibraryThing, GoodReads and BiblioCommons and examined the tags for terms that matched the reasons given for challenging the books, the general age ranges assigned to the books, and the subject matter of the books. User tags demonstrated an awareness of censorship issues related to banned or challenged books as well as an awareness of subject areas that were potentially controversial.

Abstract: The purpose of this paper is to discuss the ethical considerations of knowledge organization systems in light of children's perspectives by applying previous literature from Smiraglia's bibliocentrism (2009), Bhaba's third space theory (1994), Vygotsky's zone of proximal development (1978), and Tennis's ethical rationale (2013). Given that there is a lack of attention and consideration in knowledge organization systems for children, it is not absurd to claim that children in the knowledge organization domain tend to be treated as a marginalized user group. Where can we find children's voices in knowledge organization systems? How were these systems designed? The questions regarding the ethical considerations are discussed. This paper contributes to elevate awareness of current problems in knowledge organization systems for children and bring ethical attention to develop knowledge organization systems for children.

Abstract: This paper describes ethical considerations surrounding traditional music knowledge and documents, both from the author's experiences as apprentice to a renowned Irish fiddler, and from other music practitioners. Frohmann's (2004) informativeness of documents, Turner's (2007) oral documents, and writings of Briet and Otlet provide the theoretical underpinnings necessary to argue for and describe alternative documents: memory, metaphor, and storytelling. Examples of these alternative types of documents from the Irish music tradition and other world music traditions provide a basis for examining knowledge and documentation practices in traditional musics. Additional challenges for knowledge organization and traditional musics are related to attribution and ownership, as well as secrecy and privacy. What might be termed an "ethics of evidence" unites these traditional music knowledge and documentation issues into a single challenge for knowledge organization.

Abstract: Bibliocentricity in the library catalog arose from the practice of resource description, which emerged from the simple listing of books as objects with little reference to their intellectual content. Combined with shifting cultural conceptions of authorship, this led to a complex system in which the implicit

KO

KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

concept of "goodness" affected the efficacy of description of varying resources. Issues of domain-specificity, cultural origins or contexts of usage have been disregarded in deference to book-like considerations. *RDA* (*Resource Description and Access* provides for analytical descriptions using the knowledge-based *FRBR* conceptual model of entities based on the artifactual intersection of intellectual works and cultural information carriers. The more empirically-based *FRBRoo*, an object-oriented revision of the conceptual model, reflects the atemporality of instantiation. *FRBRoo* seems promising as a potential additional facet for expressing structural components of knowledge represented by traditionally conceptual KOSs. In this study two cases are analyzed from the point of view of both *RDA* and *FRBRoo*. Analysis shows how little synergy has been gained through *RDA*'s implementation of the *FRBR* model. The cases analyzed using *RDA* and *FRBRoo* serve as artifacts of cultural discourse, by which the measure of objective violence reflects the degree to which individual works still cannot be disambiguated.

Lee, Wan-Chen. **Culture and Classification: An Introduction to Thinking about Ethical Issues of Adopting Global Classification Standards to Local Environments.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 302-307. 24 references.

Abstract: Ethical issues arise from adapting standardized classification schemes to local environments. Research affirms mutual influences between culture and classification schemes, however, there are various conceptions of culture. Before diving deeper into discussions on designing a culturally sensitive model of classification and providing ethical information services, it is critical to clarify how culture is defined in the literature. In order to gain a deeper understanding of how scholars view the concept of culture, we review, compare, and aggregate discussions on culture from two bodies of literature: knowledge organization and anthropology. Based on the review, we then propose a working definition of culture for knowledge organization research. This definition points to areas of further research concerning culture, ethics, and knowledge organization.

McTavish, Jill. **The Ethics of Querying and Permeating Canadian Everyday Life Nutritional Classification Technologies and Processes.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 308-315. 47 references.

Abstract: Bowker and Star (1999) remind us that there is a moral and ethical agenda involved in querying classifications. In this paper I discuss how we can apply this argument to everyday life classifications, such as government produced food guides, in order to investigate the moral and ethical choices that are built into these technologies. While scholars have shown that everyday life classification processes can point out the limitations of everyday life classification technologies, in this paper I discuss how the food classificatory practices of 18 Canadian registered dietitians reinforce the understandings of health offered by Canada's food guide, at times to the detriment of those with non-standard understandings of health. While, in this study, registered dietitians' understandings of health did not address the limitations of Canada's food guide, I also discuss registered dietitians' suggestions for how the food guide could be modified to accommodate non-standard understandings of health. Similar to Olson's (2002) techniques for breaching limits, these suggestions offer a starting point for developing an ethical relationship with those individuals and communities whose understandings of health are not represented by the food guide.

Oravec, Jo Ann. **The Moral Imagination in an Era of "Gaming Academia": Implications of Emerging Reputational Issues in Scholarly Activities for Knowledge Organization Practices.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 316-323. 24 references.

Abstract: Many participants in higher education build academic reputations in conjunction with their research initiatives (and subsequent citations) along with their teaching efforts. An assortment of reputational considerations related to scholarly publication and teaching is emerging in part as a result of availability of various Internet search and analysis applications. Examinations of ghostwriting efforts, citation circles, and dubious authorship assignments (such as "gift" authorship) are becoming easier to conduct even for individuals outside of the institutions involved. Although questionable publication and teaching practices have been reported for a number of years, the ability to monitor what is going on in a wide assortment of academic contexts has just recently emerged with widely-available tools such as Google Scholar, ResearchGate, and Ratemyprofessors.com. Forms of plagiarism have also been made more readily detectable through various technological applications. This paper addresses ethical issues involved in these potentially-problematic scholarly practices. It also explores ethical dimensions of an assortment of transparency-related university, professional organization, and third-party initiatives that analyze academic activity. It frames the notion of the "moral imagination" in terms of specific efforts to "game" academics, initiatives undertaken possibly for personal reputational gain on the part of higher education participants or increases in institutional rankings.

Arboit, Aline Elis, Chaves Guimarães, José Augusto. **The Ethics of Knowledge Organization and Representation from a Bakhtinian Perspective.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 324-331. 27 references.

Abstract: This paper arises from the possibility of a theoretical dialogue between the socio-cognitive perspectives of knowledge organization and the Bakhtinian concepts on conscience, "responsible act," "responsive understanding," and polyphony as attitudes that motivate the dialogism that is inherent to language. Those questions allow us to recognize the professional that organizes and represents knowledge as someone who has an inter-

KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION   KO

subjective conscience, a product composed by two axes that are indeed deeply connected: the "self" and the "other." Therefore, the acts of representing and organizing knowledge are deeply affected by external discourses and by internal discourses. Those different discourses come together at the moment of representing the knowledge and act as a response to the dialogues between the external and the internal discourses. As a consequence, the indexing/classification codes, terms or signs assume a dialogical and dynamic representativeness in order to correspond not only to the contents of the documents but also to dialogue with a diverse user community, by the recognition of the alterity/otherness of the social actors and the social situations. Finally, it is important to point out the need of an ethical and democratic attitude of the indexer/classifier, in order to represent the social pluralism and show an equipollence of social voices.

McQueen, Kelli. **Ethical Issues of Knowledge Organization in Designing a Metadata Schema for the Leo Kottke Archives.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 332-338. 14 references.

Abstract: Designing a metadata schema for the Leo Kottke Archives presents an interesting case study on the ethics of archival representation in a digital environment. This paper discusses three significant values shared between the archivist and artist: fair representation, accessibility, and control. Fair-representation explores the concept of authenticity and the need for an ontology suited specifically to music and finger-style guitar. Accessibility is important to both the archivist and artist: to see information creative works widely circulated. Digital access promotes wide dissemination, but makes uses more difficult to control. Beyond moral values, this last value of control has significant legal implications because of copyright. The archivist must find solutions to ethical questions of the individual's right and the good of society when seeking a balance between access and control.

McCourry, Maurine. **Domain Analytic, and Domain Analytic-Like, Studies of Catalog Needs: Addressing the Ethical Dilemma of Catalog Codes Developed with Inadequate Knowledge of User Needs.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 339-345. 34 references.

Abstract: Although cataloging in libraries has been done for decades with the oft-stated intention of serving user needs, there is little evidence that those needs have been empirically assessed. This paper proposes a domain analytic model for systematically making such assessments, and for altering existing cataloging practice to meet the assessed needs. The author's dissertation research into the catalog needs of a single, narrowly-defined domain is used as an example of the type of study that may be repeated with an infinite number of domains, thereby providing a type of data regarding catalog needs not previously available.

Pachú da Silva, Andrieli, Chaves Guimarães, José Augusto, Bolfarini Tognoli, Natália. **Ethical Values in Archival Arrangement and Description: An Analysis of Professional Codes of Ethics.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 346-352. 38 references.

Abstract: The international literature on information science has devoted attention to ethical studies in information, especially due to the development of information technologies. However, the information organization activities have incipient ethical studies that are mostly focused on libraries. Thus, the area of archival science still lacks studies of this nature, which leads to question how the codes of ethics for archivists address issues related to ethical dilemmas of information organization activities, especially in core activities of arrangement and document description. Thus, this study aims to identify and analyze ethical values related to those aforementioned activities, by analyzing the codes of the following countries: Brazil, Portugal, France, Spain, Australia, Canada, USA, New Zealand, United Kingdom and Switzerland and the ICA codes of ethics. Applying a content analysis, the following values were found: access and use, authenticity, confidentiality, conservation, custody, impartiality, information access, information security, physical preservation of the record, reliability, respect for provenance, respect for the original order, respect for the preservation of the archival value of the record.

Shoemaker, Elizabeth. **No One Can Whistle a Symphony: Seeking a Catalogers' Code of Ethics.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 353-357. 13 references.

Abstract: This paper examines the limited literature about ethics of cataloging in order to elucidate the kind of situations catalogers face with minimal ethical guidance, and the questions those situations raise for the profession. Existing codes of ethics for library staff offer only peripheral guidelines for catalogers, leaving them adrift when ethical issues arise. Ultimately the lack of a clear code of ethics for information organization reinforces existing mystification around the role of catalogers within the library and causes difficulty in justifying decisions to supervisors and administrators. While ALA has a professionally accepted code of ethics, and ALCTS has a supplement to it, these codes are inadequate to clarify and guide cataloging work. Two vastly different approaches to a code of ethics for catalogers are considered for both their strengths and weaknesses. The author will make recommendations about what a code of ethics for catalogers should include, and who should be responsible for creating a new code for the profession.

Lawrence, Emily. **Everything is a Recommendation: Netflix, Altgenres and the Construction of Taste.** *Knowledge Organization. 42(5)*, 358-364. 24 references.

Abstract: Netflix is a popular subscription streaming service for film and television content. The system uses non-canonical

KO   KNOWLEDGE ORGANIZATION

genre classifications called "altgenres" to recommend clusters of works to individual users based on their explicit and implicit preferences. Although altgenre recommendations tend to appear maximally scientific and value-neutral, they are in fact interpretive arguments in service of corporate goals. This paper explores some rhetorical elements and potential ethical ramifications of altgenres *qua* arguments.